Advancing Cultural Rigor in Hospital Births and Perinatal Quality Improvement: The SACRED Birth Movement

Karen A. Scott, MD, MPH, FACOG
• The following personal financial relationships with commercial interests relevant to this presentation that existed during the past 12 months:
  • < Maternal Care Quality Improvement Expert Black Mamas Matter Alliance Merck for Mothers Safer Childbirth Cities (KA Scott)>  
• I offer one set of perspectives and a few possibilities to reimagine research, policy, service provision, and education
I am a Southern born and raised Black woman from East Nashville before gentrification.

I am grateful for the gift of a formal liberal arts education from 5th grade until completion of medical school.

I am a lifelong learner. This is the way.

I identify as a proud Reproductive Justice Avenger, Wakanda Healer, Yoda Follower, Kare Bear Hugger, Crunk Public Health Scholar, Applied Epidemiologist, and Health Systems Transformer.

I am celebrating my 19th year Anniversary as a Community-Based trained and serving OBGYN.

My main purpose is to advance Cultural Rigor through the operationalization of Black Feminism, Reproductive Justice, and Research Justice in participatory Quality Improvement (QI) science, practice, research and interprofessional education & training.
LEARNING OBJECTIVES

At the end of the presentation, the participant will be able to:

• Explain the limitations in closing the perinatal death gap between Black mothers and birthing people and other racial/ethnic groups

• Utilize three theoretical frameworks to re-imagine the unique lived experiences of Black women and people in society and in hospital births.

• Explain the value of Black birthing narratives and community wisdom in measure development, QI, and hospital performance evaluation, with an emphasis on the participatory Patient-Reported Measure of OBstetric racism©, also known as the PREM-OB Scale™
OUR VISION:
SACRED BIRTH FOR BLACK MOTHERS & BIRTHING PEOPLE

Sacred birth is a radical attitude towards **human births**, specifically **Blackness, Black bodies, and Black births**, that regards all birth activities as fundamentally normal, healthy, spiritual, familial, magical, transformative, erotic, communal, emancipatory, and power-activating.

Sacred birth encourages diverse and inclusive birth pleasure, practices, care, spaces, options, partners, communities, and experiences.

The sacred birth movement advocates for safer, respectful, dignified, high quality "participatory" birth care, conditions, experiences, and outcomes, and improved workforce diversification, development, sustainability, and restoration of Black Midwifery care and Black Doula support models as part of its campaign.

Adaptation of Sex Positivity by Karen A. Scott, MD, MPH, FACOG on April 11, 2018
OUR TRUTHS

- We believe, trust, value, and adore Black people, women, & mothers.
- Black people, women, and mothers are worthy.
- We protect, prioritize, cite, and amplify Black women’s/people’s voices, intellectual thoughts, lived experiences, and political activism.
- We activate and advance the power and potential, not pathology, of Black people, women, and mothers and our given and chosen kin
What are the contributing factors & actors in maintaining the persistent death gap between Black mothers/birthing people & other racial/ethnic groups?
First, Do No Harm: Why Philanthropy Needs to Re-Examine Its Role in Reproductive Equity and Racial Justice

Karen A. Scott, Stephanie Bray, and Monica R. McLemore

Published Online: 12 Mar 2020
https://doi.org/10.1089/heq.2019.0094
CONSEQUENCES OF PHILANTHROPIC REDLINING IN PERINATAL QUALITY IMPROVEMENT

- Community Harm
  - Shared language & meaning
  - Collaboration & Coordination
  - Collective Advancement

- Cultural Arrogance
  - Cultural Arrogance
  - Cultural Arrogance
  - Cultural Arrogance
REPRODUCTIVE AND PERINATAL APARTHEID IN THE U.S.

Population control programs, practices, and policies

Criminalization of sex, reproduction and motherhood/parenthood

Rapid termination of parental rights for those deemed "unfit" by the state

Environmental degradation with infertility, miscarriages, and other adverse health outcomes

Access to non-medicalized birthing options, attendants, and support persons

Structural stigmatization of Mothers at the Margins

Differential access to Assisted Reproductive Technology

Resistance to expanding definitions of partnering and parenting options and configurations

Maternity/Parental leave & affordable childcare

Stable housing and incomes

Safe, affordable, and sustainable neighborhoods: clean air, water, food, & shelter

State sanctioned policy brutality and murders
Leith Mullings

RESISTANCE AND RESILIENCE: THE SOJOURNER SYNDROME AND THE SOCIAL CONTEXT OF REPRODUCTION IN CENTRAL HARLEM

This article explores the consequences of class exploitation, racial discrimination, and gender subordination—as expressed in environmental racism, employment insecurity, and problematic housing conditions—on the health and well-being of working-class and middle-strata women in Harlem. It argues that an intersectional approach, examining the simultaneous intersection of race, class, and gender, tells us more about racial disparities than do explanatory paradigms of biological race or lifestyle choices. African American women address difficult conditions through the development of women-centered support groups, as well as other forms of resistance. The Sojourner Syndrome is an interpretive framework that speaks to the historical dialectic of oppression, resilience, and resistance. It is proposed as an approach to understanding infant mortality and other health issues.

Leith Mullings is Presidential Professor of Anthropology at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York. She received her Ph.D. in anthropology from the University of Chicago. Her books include Therapy, Ideology and Social Change: Mental Healing in Urban Ghana (1984); Cities of the United States (editor, 1987); On Our Own Terms: Race, Class and Gender in the Lives of African American Women (1997); Let Nobody Turn Us Around: Voices of Resistance, Reform and Renewal, an African America Anthology (2000), credited with Manning Marable); Stress and Resilience: The Social Context of Reproduction in Central Harlem (2001), with Alaka Walji; Freedom: A Photobiography of the African American Struggle (2002, with Manning Marable). She has written articles on such subjects as stratification, ethnicity, race, gender, health, globalization, participatory research, and public policy.

In 1995 Professor Mullings was awarded the Chair in American Civilization at the Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales in Paris, France, and in 1997 she received the Prize for Distinguished Achievement in the Critical Study of North America from the Society for the Anthropology of North America. She currently serves on the AAA Executive Board.

KEYWORDS: African Americans, gender, health disparities, intersectionality, infant mortality, racism.

Sojourner Truth was born into slavery in the area of Ulster County, New York, in the late 1790s. Sold away from her parents and her one remaining sibling at the age of nine, she was enslaved for almost thirty years in extremely difficult conditions before being liberated by the New York State Emancipation Act of 1827. During slavery, she was sexually abused and physically assaulted. Some of her children were sold into bondage. In 1843 she assumed the name Sojourner Truth and began to travel across the country as an abolitionist, rights of woman, and temperance preacher, promoting the idea of Black freedom to inspire northern Whites to oppose the legality of slavery. She also worked closely with leading abolitionists and became involved in the early women’s rights movement. Her personal story of suffering and her courageous determination to overcome adversity inspired thousands of people. Her name became identified with the strength and resilience of African American women who, like her, have faced numerous obstacles to personal and collective achievement.

The story of Sojourner Truth has become an important symbol of both the constraints and the activism characterizing the lives of African American women. It conveys a message about the interaction of race, class, and gender, as well as the dialectic of oppression, resilience, and resistance. Named for Sojourner Truth, the Sojourner Syndrome offers an interpretive framework designed to provide a broader understanding of why African American women and men die younger and, as compared to Whites, have higher rates of morbidity and mortality for most diseases. It incorporates an intersectional approach, which emphasizes the necessity of examining how race, class, and gender operate in the lives of African American women and how they interact to produce health effects.

The intersectional lens reframes our perspective on health and illness in several important ways. It invites us to understand race, class, and gender as relational concepts not as attributes of people of color, the dispossessed, or women but as historically created relationships of differential distribution of resources,
Obstetric racism sits at the intersection of obstetric violence and medical racism. It describes the mechanisms and practices of subordination to which Black women and people’s reproduction - including preconception, pregnancy, prenatal, labor, birth, and postpartum care, are subjected that track along histories of anti-Black racism.

Obstetric racism is a threat to positive birth outcomes.

Keywords: Black women; United States; labor and delivery; medical encounters; obstetric racism; pregnancy.
Obstetric racism sits at the intersection of obstetric violence and medical racism & describes the mechanisms and practices of subordination to which Black women and people's reproduction—including preconception, pregnancy, prenatal, labor, birth, and postpartum care—are subjected that track along histories of anti-Black racism.

“You push out the baby, and then you go back on the fields, and you keep picking the cotton.”

- Black mother in LA, March 2019
“Though he put me back together, I still don’t feel WHOLE.”
THE SACRED BIRTH STUDY: VALIDATION OF A PATIENT-REPORTED EXPERIENCE MEASURE OF OBSTETRIC RACISM®, PREM-OB SCALE™

To date, no validated participatory PREM-OB Scale™ exists that characterizes the “impact” of the quality of hospital-based perinatal care on the patient experience, as defined for, by, and with Black mothers and birthing people, in dignified and equitable partnerships with Black women-led community-based organizations & Black women scholars.
THE SACRED BIRTH STUDY:

Aim 1: Validate a patient reported experience measure of obstetric racism, the PREM-OB Scale™, through field testing among 1000 Black mothers and birthing people.

Aim 2: Develop a community centered-people focused hospital-based QI toolkit with Black women-led CBOs.

Aim 3: Examine the association between the PREM-OB scale™, COVID-19 pandemic hospital responses, and birth outcomes and experiences.

@SACRED_PREM_OB
https://sacredbirth.ucsf.edu
PARTICIPATORY QUALITY IMPROVEMENT RESEARCH (QIR):

QI Experts
Clinicians
Data Scientists
Hospital Administration

Black mothers & birthing people
Black community leaders
Black women activists
Black women artists
Black women scholars
In Social Sciences & Public Health

POWER SHIFT

Knowledge Generators, Guardians, & Disseminators
PARTICIPATORY
QI SCIENCE, PRACTICE, & RESEARCH

Name the problem

Persistent Death or Near Death Gap

Define the phenomenon through Black Feminist Intellectual Thought & Political Activism

Reproductive & Perinatal Apartheid
Sojourner Syndrome
Obstetric Racism

Propose methods to measure, monitor, & modify the problem

Black Women-Led/Serving CBOs
Transdisciplinary Transgenerational Scholarship of Black Women
Patient-Reported Experience Measure of Obstetric Racism©
Virtual Community Driven QI Prioritization
OBSTETRIC RACISM IS A THREAT TO SACRED BIRTH.
CULTURAL RIGOR

SCOTT KA, BRAY S, MCLEMORE MR. FIRST, DO NO HARM: WHY PHILANTHROPY NEEDS TO RE-EXAMINE ITS ROLE IN REPRODUCTIVE EQUITY AND RACIAL JUSTICE. HEALTH EQUITY. 2020;4:17-22.

SOCIAL MOVEMENT:
Black Feminist Intellectual Thought & Political Activist in Participatory Perinatal QI

ANALYTIC FRAMEWORK:
Reproductive & Perinatal Apartheid, Sojourner Syndrome, Obstetric Racism:

PRAXIS:
Participatory QI Science, Practice , & Research
PREM-OB Scale™, & Community Driven Virtual QI Prioritization Protocol

VISION:
#SACREDBirth Movement to #EndObstetricRacism in Hospital Settings
Patient Experience

Black women & people
Black nurse midwives
Black doulas
Black lactation educators
Black women-OBs
Black women scholars
Black women activists
Black women artists
Black social networks/kinship
Black women-led CBOs

Sojourner Syndrome
Persistent gap in perinatal death & near death
Obstetric Racism
Reproductive & Perinatal Apartheid

Reproductive Justice
Research Justice
Black Feminist Praxis

The Arc of Cultural Rigor
Advancing Cultural Rigor in Perinatal QI Science, Practice, & Research

American Anthropologist / Early View

COMMENTARY

Obstetric Racism: Naming and Identifying a Way Out of Black Women's Adverse Medical Experiences

Karen A. Scott, Dána-Ain Davis

First published: 14 March 2021
https://doi.org/10.1111/aman.13559

Feminist Anthropology / Early View

Situating Research

The Rise of Black Feminist Intellectual Thought and Political Activism in Perinatal Quality Improvement: A Righteous Rage about Racism, Resistance, Resilience, and Rigor

Karen A. Scott

First published: 11 April 2021
https://doi.org/10.1002/fea2.12045
The SACRED Birth Study
Patient Reported Experience Measure of Obstetric Racism®
PREM-OB Scale™:
Meanings, Measures, and Narratives
"I felt like my birthing experience was akin to the stories that many black women recount. I was in the hospital for two and a half days in labor. I only had one black nurse. That was the only time that I felt like someone actually listened to me and cared about my experience.

I was left alone for hours, and later found out that this was unacceptable action by the doctors. Their actions lead to both myself and my baby becoming ill, what was almost a still birth, a stay in the NICU where my baby had to be "cooled" to slow down his brain activity in order to prevent further brain damage. This all occurred because I was left to naturally have a baby that was far too big, when I should have had a c-section. The doctors left me to tend to someone else and seemed to have forgotten. They never came back, not until things were at a dangerous point.

This was a horrible first birthing experience and because of this I do not think I want to have anymore children. I do not know if it is worth the risk of my life and the life of my future child."
PRELIMINARY SACRED BIRTH FINDINGS

Do not duplicate, share, or edit without explicit permission from Dr. Karen A. Scott, MD, MPH, FACOG, Survey Developer and Owner. The Patient Reported Experience Measure of Obstetric Racism© is protected under copyright law. The PREM-OB Scale™ is trademarked.

Anonymous donor

14 Black women-led Community Based Organizations
Danielle Reid, MBA, Executive Director, DR & Associates
Marketing & Communications Lead

N'Kyenge Ayanna Brown, MFA
Curator

CHEYENNE VARNER
professional doula, graphic designer
founder + owner of
The Educated Birth
www.theeducatedbirth.com
@TheEducatedBirth

Everyday Birth Magazine
www.everydaybirth.com
@EverydayBirth

EMAIL
hello@cheyennevavarner.com
## QUALITY IMPROVEMENT INNOVATIONS

### THE VIRTUAL QUALITY IMPROVEMENT PRIORITIZATION BY AFFECTED COMMUNITIES (V-QPAC) PROTOCOL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PREM-OB Scale™ Domains</th>
<th>Perinatal QI Priorities and Mitigations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Safety & Accountability** | Shame, Stigma, Love, Grace, and Dignity: Birthing While Black  
Patient/Community Feedback in EHR  
Language and Patient Handoff  
Shame, Stigma, Love, Grace, and Dignity: Birthing While Black  
Patient/Community Feedback in EHR  
Language and Patient Handoff |
| **Autonomy & Social Capital/Kinship** | Black Birthing Rights in Hospital Settings  
Black Women’s/People’s Autonomy: Asset vs Threat |
| **Communication & Information Exchange** | Pre-Escalation Steps Prior to Calling Hospital Security  
Use of Mediation with a Professional and Community Representative External to Hospital |
| **Racism** | Redesign and expansion of care team  
Anti-Racism Community Advisory & Accountability Board/Taskforce |
| **Empathy & Humanity** | Human Resources Accountability Metric: What is your Why? and Empathy-specific Competency Based Screening/Interviews  
SACRED Birth Assessment/Checklist for Black People Focused Care |
| **Dignity in Blackness & Holistic Care** | Explicit Informed Consent/Refusal for Every Cervical Exam  
Racial Equity Caucus for Restoration of Dignity in Blackness for patients, community, clinicians, staff, and physicians with hospital privileges |
SACRED BIRTH “Referral” PARTNERS

17 hospitals, 2 health centers, 2 health plans, 1 national community partner

SACRED Birth During COVID19

For Hospitals, Health Centers, and Health Plans

“...In a Western society that does not yet respect and honor the full brilliance, self-determination, and spiritual power of black women, the oppressive tendencies of the medical-industrial complex (MIC) violate the sacredness of birth.”

Pamela Ann Whaley Day & Akeem
Pamela Quinn

Birth Justice by Ossah and Bonaparte

17 hospitals, 2 health centers, 2 health plans, 1 national community partner
SACRED Birth, N=815 (81.5% goal)
Geographic Location
California, 297 (74.25% goal)
Outside of California 518
Memphis, TN 47 (47%)
Other US locations, 471 (94.2%)
#SACREDBirth Movement across 34 states & DC
RELATIONSHIP & COHABITATION STATUS, N=812

- **Married**:
  - Relationship status: 39.4%
  - Lives with partner: 2.9%
  - Partner lives elsewhere: 36.4%

- **Single**:
  - Relationship status: 26.7%
  - Lives with partner: 9.1%
  - Partner lives elsewhere: 14.8%
Household Composition of Black Mothers & Birthing People

- Infants & children, 0 to 5y: 730
- Children & youth, 6 to 17y: 348
- Young adults, 18 to 25y: 255
- Adults, 26 to 44y: 614
- Adults, > 45y: 175
Context: Inequitable economic return on investment for Black women’s education & occupation (Mullings 2005)

- 1 in 33 married, living w/partner, 1 in 4 single, 1 in 6 single, living w/partner
- ~ 1 in 4 with a bachelor’s and 1 in 6 with a master’s degree
- ~ 1 in 2 work 40 or more hours per week
- ~ 1 in 3 household income <$25k, 1 in 2 household income <$50k
**Sexual Orientation of Black Mothers & Birthing People**

- Lesbian: 0.9%
- Bisexual: 6.8%
- Heterosexual: 79.5%
- Queer: 0.8%
- Other: 5.5%
- Declined to state: 4.4%
- I don't know: 2.3%

Women, 99.4%
Man 0.1%
Gender queer 0.2%
Gender nonconforming/Non-Binary 0.1%
NATIONAL DATA, N=815

Qualify for parental/medical leave, N=812 (%)
- Yes: 47%
- No: 26%
- I don't know: 10%
- N/A, Not working: 17%

Length of leave after birth, N=361
- < 3wks: 1.3%
- 3-6 wks: 18.8%
- 7wks to 3mon: 52.6%
- > 3mon: 22.5%
- No plan to RTW: 2.6%
- Unknown: 2.1%
NATIONAL DATA
Birth Type, N=812

- Previous cesarean birth, N=53
- VBAC Success rate: 19 of 53 (35.8%)
HELP AND HEALTH CARE SEEKING BEHAVIOR TRENDS, N= 815

- Help to reduce violence in my home, N=58 (7.1%)
- Help to reduce violence in health care, society, work, community, N=52 (6.4%)
- Help from a lawyer or legal aid, N=52 (6.4%)
- Financial aid (money), N=125 (15.3%)
- Food assistance, N=352 (43.2%)
- Housing assistance (money or placement), N=91 (11.2%)

Context: Inequitable economic return on investment for Black women’s education & occupation (Mullings 2005)
- ~ 1 in 4 with a bachelor’s and 1 in 6 with a master’s degree
- ~ 1 in 2 work 40 or more hours per week
- ~ 1 in 3 household income <$25k, 1 in 2 household income <$50k
Q1. I wished I had more information and support about lactation, breastfeeding, or chestfeeding that was specific to Black mothers and birthing people.

Q2. I wished the hospital provided more information about possible complications during labor, birth, and postpartum (i.e. changes in blood pressure, blood loss, infection, postpartum depression, etc).

PATIENT IDENTIFIED QUALITY OF CARE DOMAINS, N=815

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>ALMOST NEVER</th>
<th>RARELY</th>
<th>SOMETIMES</th>
<th>OFTEN</th>
<th>ALWAYS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1 Racism</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>30.7</td>
<td>36.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2 Comm &amp; Info Exchange</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>15.7</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>30.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Q1. The hospital made sure I understood the information shared with me by asking me to repeat back or write down what I heard.

Q2. The hospital shared their data on birth outcomes and reassured me about hospital-wide efforts to address racism in obstetric care.
Advancing the #SACREDBirth QI Movement to #EndObstetricRacism through #HumanCenteredDesign approaches, grounded in #CulturalRigor, focusing on the South and Midwest (Where the Data Reside….Follow the Data)

360º Cultural Shifts™: Community-Staff-Nurse-Physician Supervisors & Champions
Large group trainings
Small group coaching sessions
Illustrated Clinical Narratives
Animated Video Clinical Narratives
Effective Clinical Practice Techniques
Mixed Methods Assessment & Evaluation

Building Hospital and Community Capacity & Capability of #DiagnosingNDismantlingObstetricRacism through a two-step process, using the first & only validated short & long form PREM-OB Scale™

Visit https://sacredbirth.ucsf.edu/hospitals-health-centers-and-health-plans for more information about the SACRED Birth QI Implementation & Scale-Up Program.
References


Davis D. Reproducing while Black: The crisis of Black maternal health, obstetric racism and assisted reproductive technology. Reproductive biomedicine & society online. 2020;11:56-64.


McLemore MR, Asiodu I, Crear-Perry J, Davis DA, Drew M, Hardeman RR, Mendez DD, Roberts L, Scott KA; Race, Research, and Women’s Health: Best Practice Guidelines for Investigators.; Obstetrics and Gynecology; 2019


THANK YOU!

QUESTIONS & COMMENTS…

EMAIL: KAREN.SCOTT2@UCSF.EDU OR SACREDBIRTH@UCSF.EDU
@RJEPIOBWARRIOR
@SACRED_PREM_OB

HTTPS://SACREDBIRTH.UCSF.EDU